

Common Misconceptions: Productive Struggle Causes More Robust Understanding and Learning

MISCONCEPTION

Many educators believe that struggling or grappling with challenging math tasks causes students to gain a deeper understanding than would be achieved if they learned the same skill without a struggle.

TRUTH

Productive struggle does not deepen understanding, grit, or creative problem solving. Productive struggle can lead to frustration and cause students to develop misconceptions.^a In addition, the 'false starts' involved in struggling with challenging tasks without adequate support or guidance lead to lost instructional time and inefficiency.^b

What is the problem with productive struggle?

No evidence suggests giving students partial information for making connections leads to learning.^c

The idea comes from constructivism, which runs counter to what we understand about math learning.^d

Students learning new skills require clear demonstrations and guided practice with immediate feedback.

New concepts are not learned by struggling. Making connections relies on a foundation of learned knowledge.

REFRAMING PRODUCTIVE STRUGGLE



Using productive struggle for generalization involves providing effective explicit instruction for learning and building proficiency with new math content first.



After verifying students have learned the content, teachers can provide practice opportunities for productive struggle in which students work to generalize their learning to a novel, challenging problem or task (i.e., moving the 'struggle' from the beginning to the end of the instructional sequence).

^aBrown & Campione (1994)

^bCarlson et al. (1992)

^cKirschner et al. (2010)

^dKirschner et al. (2006); Mayer (2004); Steffe & Gale (1995)

